Radiocarbon evidence for extensive plate-boundary rupture about 300 years ago at the Cascadia subduction zone

Alan R. Nelson^{*†}, Brian F. Atwater[‡], Peter T. Bobrowsky[§], Lee-Ann Bradley^{*}, John J. Clague_{||}, Gary A. Carver^e, Mark E. Darienzo^{*}, Wendy C. Grant[‡], Harold W. Krueger^{*}, Rodger Sparks^{**}, Thomas W. Stafford[†] Jr & Minze Stuiver^{††}

* US Geological Survey, MS 966, Box 25046, Denver, Colorado 80225, USA † Institute of Arctic and Alpine Research, CB 450, University of Colorado, Boulder, Colorado 80309-0450, USA [‡] US Geological Survey at Department of Geological Sciences, Box 351310, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195-1310, USA § British Columbia Geological Survey Branch, 1810 Blanshard Street, Victoria, British Columbia V8V 1X4, Canada || Geological Survey of Canada, 100 West Pender Street, Vancouver, British Columbia V6B 1R8, Canada Department of Geology, Humboldt State University, Arcata, California 95521, USA # Geology Department, Portland State University, Box 751, Portland, Oregon 97207, USA ☆ Krueger Enterprises, Inc., Geochron Laboratories Division, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA ** Rafter Radiocarbon Laboratory, Nuclear Sciences Group, Institute of Geological and Nuclear Sciences, Ltd, Box 31 312, Lower Hutt, New Zealand †† Department of Geological Sciences and Quaternary Research Center, Box 351310, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington 98195-1310, USA

THE Cascadia subduction zone, a region of converging tectonic plates along the Pacific coast of North America, has a geological history of very large plate-boundary earthquakes^{1,2}, but no such earthquakes have struck this region since Euro-American settlement about 150 years ago. Geophysical estimates of the moment magnitudes (M_w) of the largest such earthquakes range from 8 (ref. 3) to $9\frac{1}{2}$ (ref. 4). Radiocarbon dating of earthquake-killed vegetation can set upper bounds on earthquake size by constraining the length of plate boundary that ruptured in individual earthquakes. Such dating has shown that the most recent rupture, or series of ruptures, extended at least 55 km along the Washington coast within a period of a few decades about 300 years ago⁵. Here we report 85 new ¹⁴C ages, which suggest that this most recent rupture (or series) extended at least 900 km between southern British Columbia and northern California. By comparing the ¹⁴C ages with written records of the past 150 years, we conclude that a single magnitude 9 earthquake, or a series of lesser earthquakes, ruptured most of the length of the Cascadia subduction zone between the late 1600s and early 1800s, and probably in the early 1700s.

LETTERS TO NATURE

3438

Earthquake size increases with rupture length. Whereas ruptures rarely extend more than 250 km during subduction-zone earthquakes near M_w 8 (refs 6–8), ruptures nearly 1,000 km long produced the largest twentieth-century earthquakes— M_w 9.2 in Alaska and M_w 9.5 in Chile⁹. We infer possible magnitudes of plate-boundary earthquakes along the Cascadia subduction zone by estimating the length of fault rupture during prehistoric earthquakes. Although the Cascadia plate boundary is not exposed on land, rupture length can be estimated from the extent of sudden coseismic subsidence along the subduction zone. Such subsidence, inferred to record elastic extension of the North America plate or faulting within it^{3,10,11}, caused sudden submergence and burial of wetland soils at many estuaries along the Pacific coast from northern California to southern British Columbia^{1,11-17}. Entombed tree stumps and herbaceous plants rooted in the tops of buried soils^{18,19}, commonly capped by sheets of tsunami-deposited sand^{14,16,20-22}, reinforce the inference of earthquake-induced subsidence for the youngest of the buried soils at many Cascadia estuaries.

We used two methods of radiocarbon dating and several types of plant fossils to date the time that the youngest soil suddenly subsided (Fig. 1). High-precision ¹⁴C ages measured in Seattle were obtained by proportional counting of gas derived from blocks of tree rings from the outer and inner parts of stumps of trees killed by submergence at four sites (Table 1; ages from sites Cp and Nw on Fig. 1 were reported earlier⁵). Other highprecision ages at our most northerly site (PA, Fig. 1) came from a stick in tsunami-laid sand above the youngest soil and from below-ground stems (rhizomes) and attached leaf bases of a tidal-marsh herb that probably grew in the sand soon after its deposition. For each of three of the stump sites (Cp, Nw and Nh) and four other sites (Fig. 1), we used accelerator mass spectrometer (AMS) ¹⁴C methods at the New Zealand laboratory to date the stems and leaves of seven or eight individual herbs (Table 1). These herbs probably died, like the trees, from the effects of earthquake-induced subsidence^{18,19}.

These procedures increase the resolution of the dating in two ways. (1) Dating of the earthquake-killed plants reduces uncertainty in relating the age of dated material to the time of an earthquake. Annual rings in the trees show how many years probably elapsed between formation of the dated rings and the time of the earthquake(s) that killed the trees¹⁹. The AMS-dated herbs probably grew within a few years of the subsidence that killed them¹⁸. However, dated parts of many of the herbs include

LETTERS TO NATURE

FIG. 1 Cascadia subduction zone, sites sampled for ¹⁴C dating, and calendar age ranges corresponding to single C ages and means of ¹⁴C ages from each site (Table 1). Horizontal bars in column on right show calendar age ranges at two standard deviations calculated from ¹⁴O area (at the standard deviations calculated from ⁴C ages (at one standard deviation) using error multipliers of 1.0 (New Zealand laboratory) and 1.6 (Seattle laboratory)^{29,31}. Blank, shaded and pattern fills within bars mark ranges for Port Alberni (PA) high-precision (HP) ages and means of other types of ages. Small arrows on bars for the stick age from PA indicate that it is a maximum age for tsunami deposition. Ranges for stump ages have been shifted to the right by 5 years (outer-ring ages), 40 years (most inner-ring ages), 60 years (lower inner-ring range at Md), or 80 years (lower inner-ring range at Nw); such shifts are illustrated in Fig. 2 for ages from a single stump at Md. Herb and outerring age ranges indicate that subsidence occurred after AD 1660 (heavy dashed vertical line); historical records of the past 200 years restrict subsidence to before about 1850 and probably before about 1800 (vertical shaded bar). Shaded interval between 1700 and 1720 shows likely time of subsidence inferred from the least ambiguous ages from southern Washington and northern California.



perennial stems that may predate subsidence by more than a few years (see below). (2) Analytical errors can be reduced by averaging ages (Table 1) from single plants that died at or about the same time²³. Contemporary death has been tested at Mad River slough (Md, Fig. 1), where matching the ring-width patterns implies that the dated stumps died within four years of one another¹⁹. Ages grouped by sample type at each site passed a χ^2 test for contemporaneity²³ at the 95% level.

Mean ages for each sample type (Table 1) do not differ statistically among sites. Stump means overlap at one standard deviation, both for inner rings and for outer rings. Although many herb means differ from each other at one standard deviation, all herb means passed the χ^2 test for contemporaneity at the 95% level.

Despite agreement by sample type, AMS ages on earthquakekilled herbs appear systematically greater than high-precision ages on earthquake-killed trees (Table 1). The mean age for eight herbs from the Nehalem site $(179 \pm 15^{-14}\text{C-yr BP})$ is significantly greater than the mean age of rings averaging five years before tree death from three stumps at this site $(128 \pm 09^{-14}\text{C-yr BP})$. Herb ages are also greater, though not significantly at the 95% level, than a high-precision age on the outer 10 rings of a stump at the Copalis site. Further, the mean herb age of $161 \pm 15^{-14}\text{C-yr}$ yr BP at the Niawiakum River exceeds the range of ^{14}C ages that correspond (according to the calibration curve of Fig. 2) to AD 1700–1720, the likely time of tree death at this site (see below).

Neither of two possible explanations—systematic age differences between measurements from different laboratories, and dating of long-lived parts of herbs—appears to account fully for the disagreements between AMS-herb ages and stump ages. No systematic differences have been apparent between the Seattle and New Zealand laboratories in age comparisons among ¹⁴C laboratories^{24,25}. In our only interlaboratory comparison, the outermost ring of a stump at the Copalis River ('control' in Table 1 and Fig. 1) gave a mean AMS age 26 ± 24 ¹⁴C-yr greater than a high-precision age on the outer 10 rings of the stump. We speculate that some fraction of the woody or decay-resistant parts of many of the AMS-herb samples grew as much as one or two calendar decades before the earthquake(s) that killed the nearby trees. Woody perennial stem bases made up 50-90% by weight of most samples of the herb *Potentilla pacifica* (70% of herb samples). Samples of the stems of *Juncus balticus* (15% of herb samples) included parts of its resistant rhizomes. However, dating of samples consisting mostly of the annual leaves of a sedge, probably *Carex lyngbyei*, at the Coquille River gave the greatest of the AMS mean ages (Table 1), and we found no relation between the proportion of woody or resistant material in dated samples and their ¹⁴C ages.

Converted to ranges (95% confidence interval) of calibrated (approximately calendar) years, the means of the herb and outerring ages show that the most recent coseismic subsidence at each site occurred after AD 1660 (Fig. 1). This is the earliest date consistent with the herb means at each of the seven herb-dated sites. The outer-ring stump means exclude ages earlier than 1680 at three of the herb sites (Cp, Nw, Nh) and at Mad River slough.

Inner-ring ages from stumps narrow the time of subsidence in California and Washington to the early 1700s. Ages on three different blocks of rings from a stump at Mad River slough limit tree death to about 1700–20; these ages eliminate other possible dates by matching distinctive steps (wiggles) in the calibration curve that relates radiocarbon time to calendar time (Fig. 2). Similar wiggle matching for a stump at the Niawiakum River in southern Washington implies tree death between about 1710 and 1730 (refs 5, 26). If all the dated stumps in southern Washington died within a few years of one another, 40-year-before-death ages (inner-ring) from six of these stumps can be averaged and the resulting mean—209 \pm 06 ¹⁴C-yr BP—can be used to further narrow the time of subsidence in southern Washington⁵. This time is between 1703 and 1715, as estimated with recently revised data for ¹⁴C calibration²⁶.

Both high-precision ages from the tsunami deposit at Port Alberni are consistent with tsunami deposition after the middle 1600s (Fig. 1). The rhizomes, which should shortly postdate the tsunami deposit into which they grew, formed no earlier than 1670. The tsunami probably coincided with the most recent coseismic subsidence on the southwest coast of Vancouver Island²¹.

LETTERS TO NATURE

| TABLE 1 Radiocarbon ages on plant remains near the top of the youngest buried soil | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|
| | Distance | No of | Least | Weighted | Greatest |
| Site | (km)* | ages | age | mean age | age |
| High-precision ages on inner tree rings that average 40 years before tree death | | | | | |
| Copalis River | 740 | 3 | 199 ± 15 | 207 ± 09 | 219 ± 19 |
| Niawiakum River | 685 | 3 | 189 ± 20 | 210 ± 09 | $\textbf{219}\pm\textbf{13}$ |
| Nehalem River | 585 | 1 | | 211 ± 13 | |
| Mad River slough | 60 | 2 | 202 ± 11 | 214 ± 08 | 225 ± 10 |
| High-precision ages on inner tree rings that average 60 or 80 years before tree death | | | | | |
| Niawiakum River | 685 | 1 | | 301 ± 10 | (rings 75-86) |
| Mad River slough | 60 | 1 | | 282 ± 14 | (rings 59–61) |
| High-precision ages on outer tree rings that average five years before tree death | | | | | |
| Copalis River | 740 | 1 | | 112 ± 11 | |
| Nehalem River | 585 | 3 | 124 ± 14 | 128 ± 09 | 132 ± 11 |
| Mad River slough | 60 | 4 | 098 ± 14 | 120 ± 08 | 137 ± 14 |
| High-precision age on outer tree rin | ngs 1–20 | | | | |
| Niawiakum River | 685 | 1 | | 152 ± 30 | |
| High-precision ages on rhizomes and attached leaf bases of a tidal-marsh herb and a stick in tsunami-deposited sand | | | | | |
| Port Alberni | 980 | 1 | | 145 ± 12 | (herb) |
| Port Alberni | 980 | 1 | | 261 ± 14 | (stick) |
| AMS age on a control sample cons | isting of an outer | r tree ring formed one | e year before tree deat | h | |
| Copalis River | 740 | 7 | 091 ± 41 | 138 ± 17 | 1.77 ± 46 |
| AMS ages on the rooted leaves and stems of tidal-marsh herbs | | | | | |
| Copalis River | 740 | 7 | 067 ± 42 | 139 ± 17 | 165 ± 44 |
| Niawiakum River | 685 | 8 | 120 ± 41 | 161 ± 15 | 272 ± 47 |
| Naselle River | 660 | 8 | 121 ± 44 | 162 ± 16 | 232 ± 45 |
| Netarta Ravi | 585 | 8 | 102 ± 41 | $1/9 \pm 15$ | 275 ± 44 |
| Salmon Bivor | 550 | 0 | 133 ± 03 | 100 ± 10 157 ± 17 | 212 ± 41 100 \pm 10 |
| | 320 | 8 | 114 ± 45 069 \pm 71 | 107 ± 17 | 199 ± 49 242 ± 45 |
| Coquine river | 520 | 8 | 003 ± 7 1 | 192 1 17 | 242 ± 45 |

High-precision gas-proportional ¹⁴C ages (in ¹⁴C-years before AD 1950) were measured through long decay counting of large samples (original weight 60–90 g) in heavily shielded counters at the Seattle laboratory^{26,29}. Reported errors do not include an error multiplier estimated at \leq 1.6. Ages on inner and outer tree rings come from stumps of Sitka spruce (*Picea sitchensis*) with the exception of one outer-ring age measured on hardwood at the Nehalem River. The number of dated rings is 10 or 20 for Washington samples and 3–10 for Oregon and California samples. The two high-precision ages from Port Alberni were measured on the rhizomes (below-ground stems) and attached leaf bases of the herb *Triglochin maritima* and on a bark-free stick (species unidentified). A radon correction²⁶ accounts for the difference between some calendar age ranges reported here and in 1991⁵. AMS ages (in ¹⁴C-years before AD 1950) were measured by accelerator mass spectrometry at the New Zealand laboratory. An estimate of total analytical error is reported with each age. AMS herb samples (5–62 mg) consist of leaves of Lyngby's sedge (*Carex cf. C. lyngbye*) at Coquille River, Naselle River, Nehalem River, Netarts Bay and Salmon River. Herb samples were cleaned before AMS analysis by scraping in water under a microscope and were pretreated three times using standard procedures³⁰. Two AMS accelerator targets were prepared for each herb sample from the same CO₂ gas. Except for 8 of 61 samples, where only one target yielded an age, the mean of the two target ages is the reported age for each of the other samples. Mean inner-ring and outer-ring atum ages and mean AMS-herb ages for each herb sample from Copalis River (138 ± 17 ¹⁴C-yr er; 'control' on Fig. 1) suggests that reported errors on AMS ages renormal salt internal analytical variability^{25,32}.

* Distance north of Cape Medicino, which is at the southern end of the Cascadia subduction zone (Fig. 1).

Historical documents imply that the subsidence at all dated sites predates initial Euro-American exploration (latest AD 1700s) or settlement (early 1800s). The documents make no mention of earthquakes that could have caused coastal subsidence along a large part of the Cascadia subduction zone, particularly after widespread Euro-American settlement of coastal areas began about 1850 (refs 27, 28). Such evidence against nineteenthand twentieth-century subsidence eliminates many younger calendar age ranges not already ruled out by wiggle matching of stump ages (Figs 1 and 2).

FIG. 2 High-precision ¹⁴C ages and corresponding calendar age ranges for selected tree rings cut from a single stump rooted in the youngest buried soil at Mad River slough (Md, Fig. 1). a, Ages for three different groups of rings intersect different parts of the ¹⁴C calibration curve, which relates ¹⁴C time to calendar time²⁶. Two-standard-deviation errors for each age, calculated using an error multiplier of 1.6, are shown on the right edge of the diagram. b, Horizontal bars show the corresponding calendar age ranges, shaded as in a. c, Ranges have been shifted to the right by the number of years between the dated rings and the bark. The time at which the dated tree could have died is limited to the narrow range shown in *d* (AD 1700–1720) where the ranges for all three ages overlap.

${\mathcal A}$ Radiocarbon ages of groups of rings from a single stump



LETTERS TO NATURE

Taken together, the radiocarbon and historical evidence imply rupture along at least 900 km of the plate boundary (Table 1, Fig. 1), either in a single M_w 9 earthquake or through a series of lesser earthquakes. Because of uncertainties that include poorly understood disagreements between stump and herb ages (discussed above), the evidence merely limits the duration of possible series. Serial earthquakes could not have spanned more than the 190 years between AD 1660 and 1850. A series might have begun with a rupture of a few hundred kilometres off the Oregon coast, where we obtained the greatest of the mean herb ages (Cq, Nt and Nh, Fig. 1). But the occurrence of such a series is not confirmed by the least herb mean from Oregon (S1) or by the similarity between stump ages at the Nehalem River and those in southern Washington and northern California (Md). If a prolonged series of earthquakes began in California and proceeded

Received 14 June: accepted 23 October 1995

- Atwater, B. F. et al. Earthquake Spectra 11, 1-18 (1995).
- Nelson, A. R., Shennan, I. & Long, A. J. J. geophys. Res. (in the press).
- McCaffrey, R. & Goldfinger, C. Science **267**, 856–859 (1995).
 Heaton, T. H. & Hartzell, S. H. Science **236**, 162–168 (1987)
- Atwater, B. F., Stuiver, M. & Yamaguchi, D. K. Nature 353, 156-158 (1991).
- Ando, M. Tectonophysics 27, 119-140 (1975). 6.
- Kanamori, H. & McNally, K. C. Bull. seism. Soc. Am. **72**, 1241–1253 (1982). Thatcher, W. J. geophys. Res. **95 (B3)**, 2609–2624 (1990).
- Plafker, G. J. geophys. Res. 77, 901-925 (1972).
- 10. Dragert, H., Hyndman, R. D., Rogers, G. C. & Wang, K. J. geophys. Res. 99, 653-668 (1994).
- Clarke, S. H. Jr & Carver, G. A. Science 255, 188-192 (1992)
- 12. Peterson, C. D. & Darienzo, M. E. in Earthquake Hazards in the Pacific Northwest of the United States (eds Rogers, A. M., Walsh, T. J., Kockelman, W. J. & Priest, G. R.) (Open-File Rep. 91-441C, US Geological Surv., Denver, CO, 1991).
- 13. Nelson, A. R. in Quaternary Coasts of the United States-Marine and Lacustrine Systems (eds Fletcher, C. P. & Wehmiller, J. F.) 287-301 (Spec. Publ. 48, Soc. for Sedimentary Geology, Tulsa, OK, 1992).
- 14. Atwater, B. F. J. geophys. Res. 97 (B2), 1901–1919 (1992)
- 15. Mathewes, R. W. & Clague, J. J. Science 264, 688-691 (1994)
- 16. Darienzo, M. E., Peterson, C. D. & Clough, C. J. coastal Res. 10, 850-876 (1994).

northwards (or began in Washington and went southwards), it could not have lasted as long as the series of three earthquakes near M_w 8 off Colombia and Ecuador between 1942 and 1979. These earthquakes ruptured, from south to north, about 500 km of subduction zone in 37 years⁷. By contrast, the earthquake or earthquakes that killed the dated trees at sites 680 km apart in Washington and California occurred in less than 20 years.

Having failed to show age differences as large as those in the Colombia-Ecuador example, our dating strengthens the possibility that one plate-boundary earthquake ruptured most of the length of the Cascadia subduction zone in the early 1700s. Such a rupture would have had an area larger than 50,000 km², as judged from rupture widths inferred from geodetic and heatflow data¹⁰. This area implies an earthquake magnitude close to 9-near the upper end of the range of magnitudes considered possible at the Cascadia subduction zone³ \square

- Nelson, A. R., Jennings, A. E. & Kashima, K. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. (in the press).
 Atwater, B. F. & Yamaguchi, D. K. Geology 19, 706–709 (1991).

- Jacoby, G., Carver, G. & Wagner, W. Geology 23, 77–80 (1995).
 Clague, J. J. & Bobrowsky, P. T. Quat. Res. 41, 176–184 (1994).
 Clague, J. J. & Bobrowsky, P. T. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. 106, 1293–1303 (1994).
- 22. Hemphill-Haley, E. Geol. Soc. Am. Bull. **107**, 367–378 (1995). 23. Ward, G. K. & Wilson, S. R. Archaeometry **20**, 19–34 (1978).
- Stuiver, M. & Pearson, G. W. in Radiocarbon after Four Decades (eds Taylor, R. E., Long, A. & Kra, R. S.) 19–33 (Springer, New York, 1992).
- Scott, E. M., Cook, G. T., Harkness, D. D., Miller, B. F. & Baxter, M. S. Radiocarbon 34, 25. 520-527 (1992).
- 26. Stuiver, M. & Becker, B. Radiocarbon 35, 35-65 (1993)
- Douthit, N. South Coast History (River West, Coos Bay, OR, 1985).
 Rhonda, J. P. Astoria and Empire (Univ. of Nebraska Press, Lincoln, NE, 1990).
- 29. Stuiver, M. & Pearson, G. W. Radiocarbon 28, 805-838 (1986).
- Bradley, L. A. & Stafford, T. W. Jr Radiocarbon 36, 399–405 (1994).
 Stuiver, M. & Reimer, P. J. Radiocarbon 35, 215–230 (1993).
- 32. Long, A. Radiocarbon 32, 393-397 (1990).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS. We thank B. E. Benson for cutting blocks of rings, and P. J. Wilkinson for high-precision ¹⁴C analyses. Reviews by H. M. Kelsey, R. F. Madole, G. S. Burr and G. C. Rogers improved the manuscript. This work was supported by the National Earthquake Hazards Reduction Program of the US Geological Survey, the US Nuclear Regulatory Commission , the Geological Survey of Canada, and the British Columbia Geological Survey.