

FINAL OZONE NAAQS REGULATORY IMPACT ANALYSIS



U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Air and Radiation
Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards
Health and Environmental Impacts Division
Air Benefit and Cost Group (c439-02)
Research Triangle Park, N.C. 27711

March 2008

Table of Contents

<u>Number</u>		<u>Page</u>
	Executive Summary	ES-1
	Chapter 1: Introduction and Background.....	1-1
	Synopsis	1-1
1.1	Background.....	1-1
1.2	Role of the Regulatory Impact Analysis in the NAAQS Setting Process.....	1-2
1.2.1	Legislative Roles.....	1-2
1.2.2	Role of Statutory and Executive Orders	1-2
1.2.3	Market Failure or Other Social Purpose	1-2
1.2.4	Illustrative Nature of the Analysis	1-4
1.3	Overview and Design of the RIA.....	1-4
1.3.1	Baseline and Years of Analysis	1-5
1.3.2	Control Scenarios Considered in this RIA.....	1-6
1.3.3	Evaluating Costs and Benefits	1-6
1.4	Ozone Standard Alternatives Considered	1-7
1.5	References.....	1-7
	Chapter 2: Characterizing Ozone and Modeling Tools Used in This Analysis.....	2-1
	Synopsis	2-1
2.1	Ozone Chemistry	2-1
2.1.1	Temporal Scale	2-2
2.1.2	Geographic Scale and Transport.....	2-2
2.2	Sources of Ozone	2-3
2.3	Modeling Ozone Levels in the Future	2-3
2.3.1	CMAQ Model and Inputs	2-4
2.3.2	Emissions Inventory.....	2-6

2.4	References.....	2-10
Appendix: Chapter 2 Characterizing Ozone and Modeling Tools Used in This Analysis		
		2a-1
Chapter 3: Modeled Control Strategy: Design and Analytical Results		
	Synopsis	3-1
3.1	Establishing the Baseline	3-2
3.1.1	Control Measures Applied in the Baseline for Ozone Precursors	3-4
3.1.2	Ozone Levels for Baseline	3-7
3.1.3	National Baseline Sensitivity Analysis.....	3-9
3.2	Developing the Modeled Control Strategy Analysis	3-10
3.2.1	Controls Applied for the Modeled Control Strategy: NonEGU Point and Area Sectors.....	3-12
3.2.2	Controls Applied for the Modeled Control Strategy: EGU Sector	3-13
3.2.3	Controls Applied for the Modeled Control Strategy: Onroad and Nonroad Mobile Sectors	3-16
3.2.4	Data Quality for this Analysis.....	3-17
3.3	Geographic Distribution of Emissions Reductions.....	3-18
3.4	Ozone Design Values for Partial Attainment.....	3-22
3.5	References.....	3-25
Chapter 4: Approach for Estimating Reductions for Full Attainment Scenario.....		
	Synopsis	4-1
4.1	Development of Full Attainment Targets for Estimate of Extrapolated Costs	4-1
4.1.1	Design of Supplemental Modeling Scenarios.....	4-1
4.1.2	Results of Supplemental Modeling for Phase 1 Areas.....	4-3
4.1.3	Estimating Attainment of the 0.070 and 0.065 ppm Standards in Phase 2 Areas	4-7
4.1.4	Estimating Attainment of the 0.065 ppm Standard outside of Phase 1 and 2 Areas	4-9
4.1.5	Aggregate Results / Verification Modeling of Extrapolated Targets	4-11

4.2	Conversion of Full Attainment Percentage Targets into Extrapolated Tons	4-15
4.3	Methodology Used to Estimate the Amount of “Overcontrolled” Emissions in the Modeled Control Strategy	4-17
4.4	Conversion of Estimated Percentages of Unnecessary Emission Reductions into “Overcontrolled” Tons	4-19
Chapter 5: Engineering Cost Estimates		5-1
	Synopsis	5-1
5.1	Modeled Controls.....	5-2
5.1.1	Sector Methodology.....	5-2
5.1.2	Modeled Controls—Engineering Cost by Sector	5-5
5.1.3	Limitations and Uncertainties Associated with Engineering Cost Estimates	5-7
5.2	Extrapolated Engineering Costs.....	5-10
5.2.1	Methodology	5-10
5.2.2	Results.....	5-18
5.3	Summary of Costs.....	5-22
5.4	Technology Innovation and Regulatory Cost Estimates.....	5-25
5.4.1	Examples of Technological Advances in Pollution Control.....	5-26
5.4.2	Influence on Regulatory Cost Estimates.....	5-29
5.5	References.....	5-31
Appendix: Chapter 5 Additional Benefits Information		5a-1
Appendix: Chapter 5b Economic Impact of Modeled Controls		5b-1
Chapter 6: Incremental Benefits of Attaining Alternative Ozone Standards Relative to the Current 8-hour Standard (0.08 ppm).....		6-1
	Synopsis	6-1
6.1	Background.....	6-3
6.2	Characterizing Uncertainty: Moving Toward a Probabilistic Framework for Benefits Assessment	6-5

6.3	Health Impact Functions	6-7
6.3.1	Potentially Affected Populations	6-7
6.3.2	Effect Estimate Sources	6-7
6.3.3	Baseline Incidence Rates	6-21
6.4	Economic Values for Health Outcomes.....	6-21
6.4.1	Mortality Valuation.....	6-23
6.4.2	Hospital Admissions Valuation	6-23
6.4.3	Asthma-Related Emergency Room Visits Valuation	6-27
6.4.4	Minor Restricted Activity Days Valuation	6-27
6.4.5	School Absences	6-27
6.5	Results and Implications	6-28
6.5.1	Ozone Benefit Estimates.....	6-28
6.5.2	PM _{2.5} Co-Benefit Estimation Methodology.....	6-29
6.5.3	Estimate of Full Attainment Benefits	6-67
6.5.5	Estimates of Visibility Benefits	6-84
6.5.6	Discussion of Results and Uncertainties.....	6-85
6.5.7	Summary of Total Benefits.....	6-87
6.6	References:.....	6-95
	Appendix Chapter 6a: Additional Benefits Information.....	6a-1
	Appendix Chapter 6b: Cost Effectiveness Analysis	6b-1
	Appendix Chapter 6c: Additional Sensitivity Analyses Related To the Benefits Analysis	6c-1
	Appendix Chapter 6d: Exploring the Effects of Changes in Tropospheric Ozone on UVB.....	6d-1
	Chapter 7: Conclusions and Implications of the Illustrative Benefit-Cost Analysis	7-1
7.1	Synopsis	7-1
7.2	Results.....	7-1
7.2.1	Presentation of Results.....	7-1
7.3	Discussion of Results	7-9
7.3.1	Sensitivity of Changes to Costs and Benefits Under an Alternate Baseline Scenario.....	7-9

7.3.2	Relative Contribution of PM Benefits to Total Benefits	7-11
7.3.3	Challenges to Modeling Full Attainment in All Areas	7-11
7.4	What Did We Learn through this Analysis?	7-13
7.5	References.....	7-16
Appendix Chapter 7a: National Baseline Sensitivity Analysis.....		7a-1
Appendix Chapter 7b Post 2020 Attainment Analysis		7b-1
Chapter 8:	Statutory and Executive Order Impact Analyses	8-1
Synopsis		8-1
8.1	Executive Order 12866: Regulatory Planning and Review.....	8-1
8.2	Paperwork Reduction Act	8-1
8.3	Regulatory Flexibility Act.....	8-2
8.4	Unfunded Mandates Reform Act	8-2
8.5	Executive Order 13132: Federalism.....	8-3
8.6	Executive Order 13175: Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments.....	8-3
8.7	Executive Order 13045: Protection of Children from Environmental Health & Safety Risks	8-4
8.8	Executive Order 13211: Actions that Significantly Affect Energy Supply, Distribution or Use	8-4
8.9	National Technology Transfer Advancement Act.....	8-5
8.10	Executive Order 12898: Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations.....	8-6

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
2.1 Geographic Specifications of Modeling Domains	2-6
2.2 Control Strategies and Projection Assumptions in the 2020 Emissions Inventory	2-7
3.1 Controls for Current Ozone Standard by Sector Applied in the Baseline Determination for 2020.....	3-5
3.2 Controls Applied, by Sector, for the 0.070 ppm Control Strategy (Incremental to Baseline)	3-11
3.3 Emissions and Reductions (2020) From Applying the Modeled Control Strategy (Incremental to the Baseline).....	3-24
4.1 Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x and VOC beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet Various Alternate Ozone Standards in the Phase I Areas	4-7
4.2 Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet Various Alternate Ozone Standards in the Phase I Areas	4-7
4.3 Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet the 0.070 ppm Ozone Standard in Phase 2 Areas	4-9
4.4 Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x beyond the RIA Control Case Necessary to Meet the 0.065 ppm Ozone Standard in Phase 3 Areas	4-10
4.5a Complete Set of Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020.....	4-11
4.5b Estimated Percentage Reductions of NO _x + VOC beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020.....	4-12
4.6 Summary of the Verification Modeling Results	4-15
4.7a Complete Set of Estimated Extrapolated Emissions Reductions of NO _x Beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020.....	4-16
4.7b Estimated Extrapolated Emissions Reductions of NO _x + VOC Beyond the RIA Control Scenario Necessary to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020.....	4-17
4.8 Estimated Percentages of Modeled Control Strategy Emissions Reductions not needed to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020	4-18
4.9 Estimated 2020 Control Case Emission Reductions not needed to Meet the Various Ozone Standards in 2020.....	4-20

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
5.1	Annual Control Costs by Sector and Region, for the Modeled Control Strategy (2006\$)..... 5-6
5.2	Marginal Cost and Average Cost Values Used in Calculating M 5-16
5.3	Extrapolated Emission Reductions Needed (Post Application of Supplemental Controls) to Meet Various Alternate Standards in 2020..... 5-18
5.4	Extrapolated Cost by Region to Meet Various Alternate Standards Using Fixed Cost Approach (\$15,000/ton)..... 5-20
5.5	Extrapolated Cost by Region to Meet Various Alternate Standards Using Hybrid Approach (Mid) 5-21
5.6	Total Costs of Attainment in 2020 for Alternate Levels of the Ozone Standard 5-22
5.7	Comparison of Inflation-Adjusted Estimated Costs and Actual Price Changes for EPA Fuel Control Rules 5-30
6.1	Human Health and Welfare Effects of Ozone and PM _{2.5} 6-9
6.2	Ozone and PM Related Health Endpoints Basis for the Concentration-Response Function Associated with that Endpoint, and Sub-Populations for which They Were Computed 6-10
6.3	National Average Baseline Incidence Rates 6-22
6.4	Unit Values for Economic Valuation of Health Endpoints (2006\$)..... 6-24
6-5	Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.065 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure in 2020 (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses) 6-34
6-6	Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.065 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses)..... 6-35
6-7	Illustrative 0.065 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit..... 6-36
6-8	Illustrative 0.065 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit..... 6-37
6-9	Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.070 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure in 2020 (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses) 6-38

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
6-10 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.070 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses).....	6-39
6-11 Illustrative 0.070 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit.....	6-40
6-12 Illustrative 0.070 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit.....	6-41
6-13 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.075 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure in 2020 (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses)	6-42
6-14 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.075 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses).....	6-43
6-15 Illustrative 0.075 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit.....	6-44
6-16 Illustrative 0.075 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit.....	6-45
6-17 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.079 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure in 2020 (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses)	6-46
6-18 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.079 ppm: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses).....	6-47
6-19 Illustrative 0.079 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit.....	6-48
6-20 Illustrative 0.079 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit.....	6-49
6-21 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.065 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses, Millions of 2006\$).....	6-50
6-22 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.065 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses, Millions of 2006\$)	6-51
6-23 Illustrative 0.065 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$).....	6-52

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
6-24 Illustrative 0.065 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)	6-53
6-25 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.070 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parenthes, Millions of 2006\$)	6-54
6-26 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.070 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses, Millions of 2006\$)	6-55
6-27 Illustrative 0.070 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)	6-56
6-28 Illustrative 0.070 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)	6-57
6-29 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.075 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parenthes, Millions of 2006\$)	6-58
6-30 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.075 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses, Millions of 2006\$)	6-59
6-31 Illustrative 0.075 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)	6-60
6-32 Illustrative 0.075 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)	6-61
6-33 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.079 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Premature Mortality Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, Arithmetic Mean, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parenthes, Millions of 2006\$)	6-62
6-34 Illustrative Strategy to Attain 0.079 ppm: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with Ozone Exposure (Incremental to Current Ozone Standard, 95% Confidence Intervals in Parentheses, Millions of 2006\$)	7-63

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
6-35	Illustrative 0.079 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of PM Premature Mortality associated with PM co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)..... 6-64
6-36	Illustrative 0.079 ppm Full Attainment Scenario: Estimated Annual Valuation of Reductions in the Incidence of Morbidity Associated with PM Co-benefit (Millions of 2006\$)..... 6-65
6-38	Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Combined Morbidity and Mortality (Millions of 2006\$) for the 0.065 ppm Full Attainment..... 6-68
6-39	Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Combined Morbidity and Mortality (Millions of 2006\$) for the 0.070 ppm Full Attainment..... 6-69
6-40	Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Combined Morbidity and Mortality (Millions of 2006\$) for the 0.075 ppm Full Attainment..... 6-70
6-41	Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Combined Morbidity and Mortality (Millions of 2006\$) for the 0.079 ppm Full Attainment..... 6-71
6-42	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 3% Discount Rate) for the 0.065 ppm Alternative Standard 6-72
6-43	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 7% Discount Rate) for the 0.065 ppm Alternative Standard 6-73
6-44	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 3% Discount Rate) for the 0.070 ppm Alternative Standard 6-74
6-45	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 7% Discount Rate) for the 0.070 ppm Alternative Standard 6-75
6-46	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 3% Discount Rate) for the 0.075 ppm Alternative Standard 6-76
6-47	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 7% Discount Rate) for the 0.075 ppm Alternative Standard 6-77
6-48	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 3% Discount Rate) for the 0.079 ppm Alternative Standard 6-78
6-49	Combined Estimate of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits (Millions of \$2006, 7% Discount Rate) for the 0.079 ppm Alternative Standard 6-79
6-50	Monetary Benefits Associated with Visibility Improvements from the 0.070 Simulated Ozone Attainment Strategy in Selected Federal Class I Areas in 2020 (in millions of 2006\$) 6-84
6.51	Summary of Total Number of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} -Related Premature Mortalities and Premature Morbidity Avoided in 2020..... 6-88
6.52	Regional Breakdown of Annual Ozone Benefit Results by Health Endpoint in 2020 (thousands of 2006\$)..... 6-90
6.53	Regional Breakdown of Annual PM Benefit Results by Health Endpoint in 2020 (thousands of 2006\$) at 3% 6-91

LIST OF TABLES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
6.54 Regional Breakdown of Annual PM Benefit Results by Health Endpoint in 2020 (thousands of 2006\$) at 7%	6-92
6.55 Regional Breakdown of Annual Ozone and PM Benefit Results by Health Endpoint in 2020 (3% discount rate, thousands of 2006\$).....	6-93
6.56 Regional Breakdown of Annual Ozone and PM Benefit Results by Health Endpoint in 2020 (7% discount rate, thousands of 2006\$).....	6-94
7.1a Estimated Range of Annual Monetized Costs and Ozone Benefits and PM _{2.5} Co-Benefits: 0.075 ppm Standard in 2020 in Billions of 2006\$.....	7-3
7.1b Estimated Range of Annual Monetized Costs and Ozone Benefits and PM _{2.5} Co-Benefits: 0.079 ppm Standard in 2020 in Billions of 2006\$.....	7-3
7.1c Estimated Range of Annual Monetized Costs and Ozone Benefits and PM _{2.5} Co-Benefits: 0.070 ppm Standard in 2020 in Billions of 2006\$.....	7-3
7.1d Estimated Range of Annual Monetized Costs and Ozone Benefits and PM _{2.5} Co-Benefits: 0.065 ppm Standard in 2020 in Billions of 2006\$.....	7-4
7.2 Summary of Total Number of Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} -Related Premature Mortalities and Premature Morbidity Avoided: 2020 National Benefits.....	7-9

LIST OF FIGURES

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
1.1	The Process Used to Create this RIA..... 1-5
2.1	Map of the CMAQ Modeling Domains Used for Ozone NAAQS RIA 2-6
3.1	Counties Where Controls for Nitrogen Oxides (NO _x) Were Included for NonEGU Point and Area Sources, for the Current Ozone Standard in the Baseline..... 3-6
3.2	Counties Where Controls for Volatile Organic Chemicals (VOCs) Were Applied to NonEGU Point and Area Sources for the Current Ozone Standard in the Baseline..... 3-7
3.3	Areas Where NO _x and VOC Controls Were Included for Mobile Onroad and Nonroad Sources in Addition to National Mobile Controls for the Current Ozone Standard in the Baseline 3-8
3.4	Baseline Projected 8-Hour Ozone Air Quality in 2020 3-9
3.5	Counties Where Controls for Nitrogen Oxides (NO _x) Were Applied to NonEGU Point and Areas Sources for the RIA Modeled Control Strategy (Incremental to Baseline)..... 3-13
3.6	Counties Where VOC Controls Were Applied to NonEGU Point and Areas Sources for the Modeled Control (Incremental to Baseline) 3-14
3.7	Geographic Areas where NO _x Controls were Applied to Electrical Generating Units (EGUs) for the Modeled Control Strategy (Incremental to Baseline) 3-15
3.8	Areas Where NO _x and VOC Controls Were Applied to Mobile Onroad and Nonroad Sources in Addition to National Mobile Controls for the Modeled Control Strategy (incremental to Baseline)..... 3-17
3.9	Annual Tons of NO _x Emission Reductions for the Modeled Control Strategy (Incremental to the Baseline)..... 3-19
3.10	Percentage of 2020 Annual NO _x Emissions Reduced by Sector Incremental to the Baseline..... 3-20
3.11	Annual Tons of VOC Emission Reductions for the Modeled Control Strategy (Incremental to the Baseline)..... 3-21
3.12	Percentage of 2020 Annual VOC Emissions Reduced by Sector..... 3-22
3.13	Projected 8-Hour Ozone Air Quality in 2020 From Applying the Modeled Control Strategy 3-23
3.14	National Annual Emissions Remaining (2020) after Application of Controls for the Baseline and Modeled Control Strategy 3-24

LIST OF FIGURES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
4.1	Counties within which Across-the-Board Emissions Reductions were Applied in the Supplemental Modeling Analyses 4-2
4.2a	Projected 2020 8-hour Ozone Design Values in the RIA Control Scenario and Each of the Six Supplemental Modeling Scenarios for the Highest Three Counties within the Houston Area..... 4-4
4.2b	Projected 2020 8-hour Ozone Design Values in the RIA Control Scenario and Each of the Six Supplemental Modeling Scenarios for the Highest Counties within the Eastern Lake Michigan Area 4-5
4.2c	Projected 2020 8-hour Ozone Design Values in the RIA Control Scenario and Each of the Six Supplemental Modeling Scenarios for the Highest Counties within the Northeast Corridor 4-5
4.2d	Projected 2020 8-hour Ozone Design Values in the RIA Control Scenario and Each of the Six Supplemental Modeling Scenarios for Three Specific Areas in California 4-6
4.3a	Map of Extrapolated Cost Counties for the 0.065 ppm Alternate Standard and the Estimated Percent NOx Controls Needed to Meet that Standard 4-12
4.3b	Map of Extrapolated Cost Counties for the 0.070 ppm Alternate Standard and the Estimated Percent NOx Controls Needed to Meet that Standard 4-13
4.3c	Map of Extrapolated Cost Counties for the 0.075 ppm Alternate Standard and the Estimated Percent NOx Controls Needed to Meet that Standard 4-13
4.3d	Map of Extrapolated Cost Counties for the 0.079 ppm Alternate Standard and the Estimated Percent NOx Controls Needed to Meet that Standard 4-14
5.1	Marginal Cost Curve for Modeled Control Strategy Geographic Areas (NOX nonEGU Point and Area Source Controls Prior to Cut Points) 5-4
5.2	Marginal Cost Curve for Modeled Control Strategy Geographic Areas (VOC nonEGU Point and Area Source Controls Prior to Cut Points) 5-4
5.3	Total Annualized Costs by Emissions Sector and Region for Modeled Control Strategy in 2020 5-8
5.4	Ratio of Unspecified Emission Reductions to Known Emission Reductions Across Various Standards for Phase 1 Areas..... 5-16
5.5	Ranges of Hybrid (Mid) Average Cost/Ton Values across Geographic Areas and Standards 5-17
5.6	Extrapolated Cost by Region to Meet Various Alternate Standards Using Fixed Cost Approach (\$15,000/ton)..... 5-20
5.7	Extrapolated Cost by Region to Meet Various Alternate Standards Using Hybrid Approach (Mid) 5-21
5.8	Annual Total Costs by Region..... 5-23

LIST OF FIGURES (CONTINUED)

<u>Number</u>	<u>Page</u>
5.9 National Known Control Costs and Extrapolated Costs for Various Standards.....	5-24
5.10 Total Cost Ranges for Various Standards.....	5-25
5.11 Technological Innovation Reflected by Marginal Cost Shift	5-26
6.1 Valuation of Ozone Morbidity and Mortality Benefits Results by Standard Alternative.....	6-29
6.2 Valuation of PM Co-Benefits by Standard Alternative at 3% and 7%	6-30
6.3 Ozone and PM _{2.5} Benefits by Standard Alternative (3% and 7% Discount Rates)	6-81
6.4 Example Combined Ozone and PM _{2.5} Monetized Benefits Estimates by Standard Alternative (3% and 7% Discount Rates).....	6-82
6.5 Ozone and PM Total Benefits including all combinations of Mortality Estimates (3% discount rate).....	6-83
6.6 Ozone and PM Total Benefits including all combinations of Mortality Estimates (7% discount rate).....	6-84
6.7 Total Annual Ozone and PM _{2.5} -Related Premature Mortalities Avoided in 2020 by Standard Alternative	6-89
7.1 Range of Net Benefits (2006\$) for All Standard Alternatives (7% discount).....	7-6
7.2 Range of Net Benefits (2006\$) for Selected Standard.....	7-7
7.3 Range of Net Benefits for Select Combinations at 3% and 7%.....	7-8